

Non-independence of causes of variation: Gene-environment correlations (rGE)

Abdel Abdellaoui





a.abdellaoui@amsterdamumc.nl

dr_appie

Gene-environment correlation (rGE)

rGE: exposure to environmental condition is associated with genotype

Gene-environment correlation (rGE)

rGE: exposure to environmental condition is associated with genotype

Passive rGE: inherited environment and genotype are correlated
Evocative rGE: environment reacts to genotype
Active rGE: genotype influences behavior to search for an environment

Gene-environment correlation (rGE)

rGE: exposure to environmental condition is associated with genotype

Passive rGE: inherited environment and genotype are correlated
Evocative rGE: environment reacts to genotype
Active rGE: genotype influences behavior to search for an environment

If rGE is ignored in twin models, estimates are biased:

- Correlation between A & C acts like C
- Correlation between A & E acts like A

Modeling Extended Twin Family Data I: Description of the Cascade Model

Matthew C. Keller,^{1,2} Sarah E. Medland,³ Laramie E. Duncan,¹ Peter K. Hatemi,³ Michael C. Neale,³ Hermine H. M. Maes,³ and Lindon J. Eaves³



Estimating the Extent of Parameter Bias in the Classical Twin Design: A Comparison of Parameter Estimates From Extended Twin-Family and Classical Twin Designs

William L. Coventry^{1,2} and Matthew C. Keller³



ORIGINAL RESEARCH

Incorporating Polygenic Risk Scores in the ACE Twin Model to Estimate A–C Covariance

Conor V. Dolan^{1,4} · Roel C. A. Huijskens¹ · Camelia C. Minică^{3,5} · Michael C. Neale^{1,2} · Dorret I. Boomsma¹



ORIGINAL RESEARCH

Direct and Indirect Effects of Maternal, Paternal, and Offspring Genotypes: Trio-GCTA

Espen Moen Eilertsen^{1,6,9} · Eshim Shahid Jami² · Tom A. McAdams^{3,6} · Laurie J. Hannigan⁴ · Alexandra S. Havdahl^{1,4,5,6} · Per Magnus⁹ · David M. Evans^{5,7} · Eivind Ystrom^{1,6,8}

Behavior Genetics https://doi.org/10.1007/s10519-019-09969-4

ORIGINAL RESEARCH

Introducing M-GCTA a Software Package to Estimate Maternal (or Paternal) Genetic Effects on Offspring Phenotypes

Zhen Qiao¹ · Jie Zheng^{2,3} · Øyvind Helgeland^{4,5} · Marc Vaudel⁴ · Stefan Johansson^{4,6} · Pål R. Njølstad^{4,7} · George Davey Smith^{2,3} · Nicole M. Warrington^{1,8} · David M. Evans^{1,2,3}

Genetic Relationship Matrix (GRM), contains the genetic relationship between all pairs of individuals based on measured SNPs:

$$\hat{\pi}_{ij} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k} \frac{(x_{ki} - 2p_k)(x_{kj} - 2p_k)}{2p_k(1 - p_k)}$$

where X_{ki} is the k^{th} SNP (k=1...N) of the i^{th} person, taking the value of 0, 1, or 2 if it is AA, Aa, aa, and p_k is the frequency of allele a.



"Phenotype" should include all effects that a gene has on its environment, both **inside** and **outside** the body of the individual organism.

Psychological Medicine, 2007, 37, 615-626. © 2006 Cambridge University Press doi:10.1017/S0033291706009524 First published online 19 December 2006 Printed in the United Kingdom

REVIEW ARTICLE

Genetic influences on measures of the environment: a systematic review	Constructs	No. studies	Studies included
KENNETH S. KENDLER ^{13,*} AND JESSICA H. BAKER ^{1,3}	Stressful life events Total life events	6	Wierzbicki, 1989; Plomin et al. 1990; Kendler et al. 1993; Thapar & McGuffin, 1996; Bolinskey et al. 2004: Wang et al. 2005
	Negative life events	3	Plomin et al. 1990: Wierzbicki, 1989: Thapar & McGuffin, 1996
	Positive life events	3	Plomin et al. 1990: Wierzbicki, 1989: Thapar & McGuffin, 1996
	Independent life events	6	Plomin et al. 1990; Billig et al. 1996; Thapar & McGuffin, 1996; Foley et al. 1996; Kendler et al. 1999 Bolinskey et al. 2004
	Dependent life events	5	Plomin et al. 1990; Billig et al. 1996; Foley et al. 1996; Kendler et al. 1999; Bolinskey et al. 2004
	Selection into trauma	4	Lyons et al. 1993; Jang et al. 2001; Stein et al. 2002; Middeldorp et al. 2005
	Selection into non-assaultive trauma	2	Jang et al. 2001; Stein et al. 2002
	Divorce	2	McGue & Lykken, 1992; Middeldorp et al. 2005
	Child-based reports of parenting behavior		
	Maternal warmth	7	Rowe, 1981; Rende et al. 1992; Plomin et al. 1994; O'Connor et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtensteir et al. 2003; Neiderhiser et al. 2004
	Paternal warmth	5	Rowe, 1981; Plomin et al. 1994; O'Connor et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003
	Maternal control	5	Rende et al. 1992; O'Connor et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003; Neiderhiser et al. 20
	Paternal control	3	O'Connor et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003
	Paternal negativity	2	Plomin et al. 1994; O'Connor et al. 1995
	Paternal protectiveness	2	Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003
	Maternal protectiveness	2	Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003
	Parent-based reports of parenting behavior		
	Parental warmth	4	Perusse et al. 1994: Kendler. 1996: Deater-Deckard et al. 1999: Deater-Deckard. 2000
	Parental control	3	Kendler 1996: Losova <i>et al.</i> 1997: Spinath & O'Connor. 2003
	Parental protectiveness	3	Perusse <i>et al.</i> 1994: Kendler, 1996: Spinath & O'Connor, 2003
	Parental negativity	7	O'Connor <i>et al.</i> 1995; Losoya <i>et al.</i> 1997; Deater-Deckard <i>et al.</i> 1999, 2001; Deater-Deckard, 2000; Neiderhiser <i>et al.</i> 2004; Boivin <i>et al.</i> 2005
	Family environment		
	Cohesion/connectedness	4	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999; Jang et al. 2001
	Conflict	3	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999
	Organization	3	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999
	Expressiveness	3	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999
	Active	3	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999
	Control	3	Plomin et al. 1988, 1989; Jacobson & Rowe, 1999
	Social support Friend problem	2	Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002

ar & McGuffin, 1996 731 0.39ar & McGuffin, 1996 731 0.34r & McGuffin, 1996; Foley et al. 1996; Kendler et al. 1999; 5056 0.17et al. 1996; Kendler et al. 1999; Bolinskey et al. 2004 4459 0.31al. 2002; Middeldorp et al. 2005 6558 0.36 569 0.072005 5692 0.35l. 1994; O'Connor et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein 3446 0.37et al. 1995; Kendler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003 2664 0.34endler, 1996; Lichtenstein et al. 2003; Neiderhiser et al. 2004 2330 0.15enstein et al. 2003 1448 0.17377 0.122198 0.202198 0.26Deckard et al. 1999; Deater-Deckard, 2000 1690 0.35& O'Connor, 2003 433 0.20& O'Connor, 2003 1477 0.23Deater-Deckard et al. 1999, 2001; Deater-Deckard, 2000; 4766 0.191999; Jang et al. 2001 1911 0.241999 1428 0.30 1999 1428 0.251999 1428 0.241999 1428 0.261999 1428 0.182860 0.23Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 2 2 Relative problem Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 2860 0.38Friend support 3 Kessler et al. 1992; Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 4502 0.17Relative support 3 Kessler et al. 1992; Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 4502 0.313 Kessler et al. 1992; Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 4502 0.31Social integration 2 Kendler et al. 1997; Agrawal et al. 2002 2860 0.31

Total

N

6197

Weighted

mean

0.28

International Statistical Genetics Workshop | March 2024 | Boulder, USA

Confidants

BEHAVIORAL AND BRAIN SCIENCES (1991) 14, 373-427 Printed in the United States of America

The nature of nurture: Genetic influence on "environmental" measures

television uncontrollable viewing life events (CAP) (SATSA) quantity of controllable social support life events (SATSA) (SATSA) 0% HERITABILITY------50% HERITABILITY quality of social support (SATSA) parents' family environment (SATSA) family family control control (Rowe) (SATSA) SUBJECTIVE

OBJECTIVE

videotape observations of

mothers'control

(CAP)

HOME

observations (children)

SES

videotape obser-

vations of mothers'affection

(CAP)

family

warmth

(Rowe)

family warmth

(SATSA)

International Statistical Genetics Workshop | March 2024 | Boulder, USA

Robert Plomin^a and C. S. Bergeman^b



David van den Berg, Karin Verweij, Dirk Smit, Abdel Abdellaoui (2024; unpublished)



Explains 10% of the variance!

David van den Berg, Karin Verweij, Dirk Smit, Abdel Abdellaoui (2024; unpublished)



Educational Attainment

Income



GWASs on social outcomes contain signals from correlated traits and the **environment**



Dissecting polygenic signals from genome-wide association studies on human behaviour

Check for updates

Abdel Abdellaoui 💿 🖾 and Karin J. H. Verweij 💿

Gene-Environment Correlations - Families

Science 359, 424-428 (2018)

HUMAN GENOMICS

The nature of nurture: Effects of parental genotypes

Augustine Kong,^{1,2,3}* Gudmar Thorleifsson,¹ Michael L. Frigge,¹ Bjarni J. Vilhjalmsson,^{4,5} Alexander I. Young,^{1,2,6} Thorgeir E. Thorgeirsson,¹ Stefania Benonisdottir,¹ Asmundur Oddsson,¹ Bjarni V. Halldorsson,¹ Gisli Masson,¹ Daniel F. Gudbjartsson,^{1,3} Agnar Helgason,^{1,7} Gyda Bjornsdottir,¹ Unnur Thorsteinsdottir,^{1,8} Kari Stefansson^{1,8}*



Science 359, 424-428 (2018)

HUMAN GENOMICS

The nature of nurture: Effects of parental genotypes

Augustine Kong,^{1,2,3}* Gudmar Thorleifsson,¹ Michael L. Frigge,¹ Bjarni J. Vilhjalmsson,^{4,5} Alexander I. Young,^{1,2,6} Thorgeir E. Thorgeirsson,¹ Stefania Benonisdottir,¹ Asmundur Oddsson,¹ Bjarni V. Halldorsson,¹ Gisli Masson,¹ Daniel F. Gudbjartsson,^{1,3} Agnar Helgason,^{1,7} Gyda Bjornsdottir,¹ Unnur Thorsteinsdottir,^{1,8} Kari Stefansson^{1,8}*



HUMAN GENOMICS

The nature of nurture: Effects of parental genotypes

Augustine Kong,^{1,2,3*} Gudmar Thorleifsson,¹ Michael L. Frigge,¹ Bjarni J. Vilhjalmsson,^{4,5} Alexander I. Young,^{1,2,6} Thorgeir E. Thorgeirsson,¹ Stefania Benonisdottir,¹ Asmundur Oddsson,¹ Bjarni V. Halldorsson,¹ Gisli Masson,¹ Daniel F. Gudbjartsson,^{1,3} Agnar Helgason,^{1,7} Gyda Bjornsdottir,¹ Unnur Thorsteinsdottir,^{1,8} Kari Stefansson^{1,8*}

Non-transmitted educational attainment alleles are associated with:

- Educational attainment
- Age at first child
- High-density lipoprotein (HDL)
- BMI
- Fasting glucose level
- Height
- Cigarettes per day
- Overall health





Heritability

Prediction

Behavior Genetics https://doi.org/10.1007/s10519-020-10000-4

ORIGINAL RESEARCH

Separating Measured Genetic and Environmental Effects: Evidence Linking Parental Genotype and Adopted Child Outcomes Check for updates

Benjamin W. Domingue¹ · Jason Fletcher²



Phenotypes

 The American Journal of Human Genetics 105, 351–363, August 1, 2019
 ARTICLE

 Comparing Within- and Between-Family
 Polygenic Score Prediction

 Saskia Selzam,^{1,*} Stuart J. Ritchie,¹ Jean-Baptiste Pingault,^{1,2} Chandra A. Reynolds,³ Paul F. O'Reilly,^{1,4}

Predictive power of polygenic scores of cognitive traits (intelligence & education) was 60% greater between families than within families.



nature genetics ARTICLES https://doi.org/10.1038/s41588-022-01062-7 OPEN

Within-sibship genome-wide association analyses decrease bias in estimates of direct genetic effects



nature ARTICLES senetics https://doi.org/10.1038/s41588-022-01062-7 OPEN Check for updates

Within-sibship genome-wide association analyses decrease bias in estimates of direct genetic effects





analyses decrease bias in estimates of direct genetic effects



nature human behaviour

Article

More than nature and nurture, indirect genetic effects on children's academic achievement are consequences of dynastic social processes

Received: 12 May 2022

Accepted: 29 November 2023

Published online: 15 January 2024

Michel G. Nivard © ^{1,2}, Daniel W. Belsky^{3,4}, K. Paige Harden © ^{5,6}, Tina Baier⁷, Ole A. Andreassen © ^{8,9}, Eivind Ystrøm © ^{10,11}, Elsje van Bergen © ^{1,2,12} & Torkild H. Lyngstad © ⁷⊠



Blue squares indicate MoBa participants. White squares (grandparents) are identified through register links.

Gene-Environment Correlations - Geographic

Geography & Polygenic Scores



Moran's I = measure for geographic clustering

ARTICLES https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-019-0757-5

Genetic correlates of social stratification in Great Britain

Abdel Abdellaoui^{®1*}, David Hugh-Jones², Loic Yengo^{®3}, Kathryn E. Kemper^{®3}, Michel G. Nivard^{®4}, Laura Veul¹, Yan Holtz³, Brendan P. Zietsch^{®5}, Timothy M. Frayling⁶, Naomi R. Wray^{®3,7}, Jian Yang^{®3,7}, Karin J. H. Verweij¹ and Peter M. Visscher^{®3,7*}

Geography & Polygenic Scores

Genetic correlates of social stratification in Great Britain

Abdel Abdellaoui^{®1*}, David Hugh-Jones², Loic Yengo^{®3}, Kathryn E. Kemper^{®3}, Michel G. Nivard^{®4}, Laura Veul¹, Yan Holtz³, Brendan P. Zietsch^{®5}, Timothy M. Frayling⁶, Naomi R. Wray^{®3,7}, Jian Yang^{®3,7}, Karin J. H. Verweij¹ and Peter M. Visscher^{®3,7*}



Moran's I = measure for geographic clustering

Geography & Polygenic Scores



Moran's I = measure for geographic clustering

ARTICLES https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-019-0757-5

Genetic correlates of social stratification in Great Britain

Abdel Abdellaoui^{®1*}, David Hugh-Jones², Loic Yengo^{®3}, Kathryn E. Kemper^{®3}, Michel G. Nivard^{®4}, Laura Veul¹, Yan Holtz³, Brendan P. Zietsch^{®5}, Timothy M. Frayling⁶, Naomi R. Wray^{®3,7}, Jian Yang^{®3,7}, Karin J. H. Verweij¹ and Peter M. Visscher^{®3,7*}



Moran's I = measure for geographic clustering

ARTICLES https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-019-0757-5

human behaviour

Genetic correlates of social stratification in Great Britain

Abdel Abdellaoui^{®1*}, David Hugh-Jones², Loic Yengo^{®3}, Kathryn E. Kemper^{®3}, Michel G. Nivard^{®4}, Laura Veul¹, Yan Holtz³, Brendan P. Zietsch^{®5}, Timothy M. Frayling⁶, Naomi R. Wray^{®3,7}, Jian Yang^{®3,7}, Karin J. H. Verweij¹ and Peter M. Visscher^{®3,7*}



black lines = coal regions



black lines = coal regions



Migration & SES

ARTICLES https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-019-0757-5

Genetic correlates of social stratification in Great Britain

Abdel Abdellaoui®^{1*}, David Hugh-Jones², Loic Yengo³, Kathryn E. Kemper³, Michel G. Nivard⁴, Laura Veul¹, Yan Holtz³, Brendan P. Zietsch⁵, Timothy M. Frayling⁶, Naomi R. Wray^{3,7}, Jian Yang^{3,7}, Karin J. H. Verweij¹ and Peter M. Visscher^{3,7*}






Assessing the impact of 20th century internal migrations on the genetic structure of Estonia

Ivan A. Kuznetsov^{1,*}, Estonian Biobank Research Team¹, Mait Metspalu¹, Uku Vainik^{1,2,3}, Luca Pagani^{1,4}, Francesco Montinaro^{1,5}, Vasili Pankratov^{1,*}





Assessing the impact of 20th century internal migrations on the genetic structure of Estonia

Ivan A. Kuznetsov^{1,*}, Estonian Biobank Research Team¹, Mait Metspalu¹, Uku Vainik^{1,2,3}, Luca Pagani^{1,4}, Francesco Montinaro^{1,5}, Vasili Pankratov^{1,*}





Assessing the impact of 20th century internal migrations on the genetic structure of Estonia

Ivan A. Kuznetsov^{1,*}, Estonian Biobank Research Team¹, Mait Metspalu¹, Uku Vainik^{1,2,3}, Luca Pagani^{1,4}, Francesco Montinaro^{1,5}, Vasili Pankratov^{1,*}





• POB • POR

40

0.04

0.02

-0.02

0

50

Principal components

60

PC1, POR

70

80

--- Significant

Not significant

90

100

0.04

0.02

-0.02

0





WW Public Health England

Relationship between density of fast food outlets and deprivation by local authority*





The paper consists of two parts:

• **Part 1**: detecting gene-environment correlations using polygenic scores in up to 43,516 siblings

• **Part 2**: controlling for gene-environment correlations in GWASs in up to 254,387 participants





Variance explained by region:





Polygenic Scores in Siblings























The American Journal of Human Genetics 105, 351–363, August 1, 2019

ARTICLE

Comparing Within- and Between-Family Polygenic Score Prediction

Saskia Selzam,^{1,*} Stuart J. Ritchie,¹ Jean-Baptiste Pingault,^{1,2} Chandra A. Reynolds,³ Paul F. O'Reilly,^{1,4} and Robert Plomin¹

ARTICLE

Comparing Within- and Between-Family Polygenic Score Prediction

$$Y_{ij} = \alpha_0 + \beta PRS_{ij} + \gamma_j + \varepsilon_{ij},$$

Saskia Selzam,^{1,*} Stuart J. Ritchie,¹ Jean-Baptiste Pingault,^{1,2} Chandra A. Reynolds,³ Paul F. O'Reilly,^{1,4} and Robert Plomin¹

 $Y_{ij} = \alpha_0 + \beta PRS_{ij} + \gamma_j + \varepsilon_{ij},$ The American Journal of Human Genetics 105, 351–363, August 1, 2019 **ARTICLE** Comparing Within- and Between-Family Polygenic Score Prediction Saskia Selzam,^{1,*} Stuart J. Ritchie,¹ Jean-Baptiste Pingault,^{1,2} Chandra A. Reynolds,³ Paul F. O'Reilly,^{1,4} and Robert Plomin¹

 $Y_{ij} = \alpha_0 + \beta_W (PRS_{ij} - \overline{PRS_j}) + \beta_B \overline{PRS_j} + \gamma_j + \varepsilon_{ij}$







Betweenfamily effect We looked at adult siblings (N ~26k pairs) in UK Biobank.

PRS = Educational Attainment Polygenic Score (based on GWAS excluding all British)



Betweenfamily effect We looked at adult siblings (N ~26k pairs) in UK Biobank.

PRS = Educational Attainment Polygenic Score (based on GWAS excluding all British)

Are there any additional geneenvironment correlations at the regional level not captured by family?



We looked at adult siblings (N ~26k pairs) in UK Biobank.

PRS = Educational Attainment Polygenic Score (based on GWAS excluding all British)

Are there any additional geneenvironment correlations at the regional level not captured by family?













Adding geography significantly decreased withinfamily effect for 10 traits. The most significant 5:

- BMI ($p = 1 \times 10^{-5}$)
- Waist circumference ($p = 1 \times 10^{-4}$)
- Household income ($p = 1 \times 10^{-4}$)
- Time spent watching TV ($p = 3 \times 10^{-4}$)
- Whole body fat mass ($p = 6 \times 10^{-4}$)

These are traits that are more subject to change after siblings migrated out of the parental residence.

GWASs Controlled for Geography



Changes in SNP-based heritability



Changes in genetic correlation with SES - Educational Attainment

Educational Attainment (EA)



Changes in genetic correlation with SES - Household Income

Household Income (HI)


- Controlling for geographic region decreases the heritability for SES (education/income)



- Controlling for geographic region decreases the heritability for SES (education/income)
- Controlling for region reduces genetic correlations with SES (EA/income), most significantly for BMI, sedentary behavior, and substance use



- Controlling for geographic region decreases the heritability for SES (education/income)
- Controlling for region reduces genetic correlations with SES (EA/income), most significantly for BMI, sedentary behavior, and substance use
- Our findings can be explained driven by both passive and active gene-environment correlations





Unpublished results



Key points

Society makes genetic effects stronger.



Key points

Society makes genetic effects stronger.

We reward certain genetic propensities with a better environment, and "punish" the lack of those propensities with a worse environment.



Key points

Society makes genetic effects stronger.

We reward certain genetic propensities with a better environment, and "punish" the lack of those propensities with a worse environment.

This makes society more unequal.

This makes studying genetics more difficult.



WIRED Genetic Screening Now Lets Parents Pick the Healthiest Embryos

AT 18 MONTHS old, Aurea Yenmai Smigrodzki is inquisitive like any other toddler. She likes peanut butter, the beach, and mobile phones—or any toys that look like phones. She likes to copy her mum and dad, Thuy and Rafal, when they are using theirs. Aurea doesn't know it yet, but her birth was very special: She is the world's first PGT-P baby, meaning she is statistically less likely than the rest of us to develop a genetic disease or disorder throughout her life.







Working with 173 Clinics in 37 countries and 6 continents ... and growing.



4.2 Does Genomic Prediction screen purely cosmetic traits?

 \sim

へ

No, we only provide risk scores for polygenic traits related to diseases, not for purely cosmetic traits such as hair color and eye color. Our goal is to provide improved health to IVF families.

4.3 Does Genomic Prediction Clinical Laboratory screen embryos for increased intelligence i.e. high IQ?

No.

